



THINK • STIMULATE • BRIDGE

The Financialization of Commodity Markets: A Short-lived Phenomenon?

POLICY REPORT

Editor:

YVES JÉGOUREL



The Financialization of Commodity Markets: A Short-lived Phenomenon?

Editor:
Yves Jégourel

The Financialization of Commodity Markets: A Short-lived Phenomenon?

Copyright © 2018 by OCP Policy Center. All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical, electronic, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher.

General Coordination & Edited by: Lilia Rizk, Program Officer at OCP Policy Center

Graphic Composition: Youssef Ait el Kadi, Graphic Designer at OCP Policy Center

About OCP Policy Center

The OCP Policy Center is a Moroccan policy-oriented think tank striving to promote knowledge sharing and to contribute to an enriched reflection on key economic and international relations issues. By offering a southern perspective on major regional and global strategic challenges facing developing and emerging countries, the OCP Policy Center aims to provide a meaningful policy-making contribution through its four research programs: Agriculture, Environment and Food Security, Economic and Social Development, Commodity Economics and Finance, Geopolitics and International Relations. On this basis, we are actively engaged in public policy analysis and consultation while promoting international cooperation for the development of countries in the southern hemisphere. In this regard, the OCP Policy Center aims to be an incubator of ideas and a source of forward thinking for proposed actions on public policies within emerging economies, and more broadly for all stakeholders engaged in the national and regional growth and development process. For this purpose, the Think Tank relies on independent research and a solid network of internal and external leading research fellows.

OCP Policy Center

Ryad Business Center – South, 4th Floor, Mahaj Erryad - Rabat, Morocco

Phone : +212 5 37 27 08 08

Email : contact@ocppc.ma

Website : www.ocppc.ma

Legal Deposit: 2018MO1385

ISBN : 978-9954-9717-8-9

Summary

About OCP Policy Center	4
List of Contributors	7
List of Abbreviations	9
Foreword	11

PART I: THE PATTERNS OF COMMODITY FINANCIALIZATION..... 15

CHAPTER 1: Fertilizers Markets: In Search of the Index of Choice..... 17

Helyette Geman

I. Introduction	18
II. Financialization of commodity markets: A buzz or a reality?	18
III. Searching for the index of choice in fertilizer markets	25
IV. Conclusion	31

CHAPTER 2: Competitive Price Benchmarking in Global Commodity Markets: What Can History Teach Us?..... 33

John Baffes

I. Introduction	34
II. A brief history of competitive pricing in commodity markets	35
III. The reemergence of competitive price benchmarking	42
IV. The transition to competitive price benchmarking.....	45
V. Impediments to (and consequences of) global price benchmarking	52
VI. Concluding remarks	58

**PART II: THE IMPACT OF FINANCIALIZATION ON COMMODITY
MARKETS AND INDUSTRIES 75**

**CHAPTER 3: Benefits and Disadvantages of Commodity Financialization:
Selected Agricultural Market Experiences 77**

Luciano Gutierrez

I. Introduction	77
II. Financialization of commodity price formation.....	80
III. Methodology.....	84
IV. Data.....	85
V. Empirical results and discussion	87
VI. Conclusions.....	91

**CHAPTER 4: Market Structures and Financialization: The Examples of
Aluminum, Iron Ore and Steel Futures Markets 95**

Yves Jégourel

I. Introduction	96
I. The path towards financialization for the aluminum, iron ore and steel markets.....	98
II. Financialization: cause, consequence or catalyst of changing market structure?	107
III. Conclusion.....	119

PART III: THE FUTURE OF COMMODITY FINANCIALIZATION ... 123

**CHAPTER 5: From Chicago to Shanghai and Dalian: Apprehending the Future
of Chinese Commodity Derivative Markets..... 125**

Michael Tamvakis

I. Introduction	125
I. A brief history of commodity exchanges in China	127
II. Overview of commodity contracts traded	132
III. The performance of Chinese commodity exchanges	138
IV. Looking ahead	143

List of Contributors

John Baffes, Senior Economist and Editor of the Commodity Markets Outlook, The World Bank.

Helyette Geman, Director of the Commodity Finance Center at Birkbeck University of London and Professor of Mathematical Finance at Johns Hopkins University & Senior Fellow, OCP Policy Center

Luciano Gutierrez, Professor of Agricultural Economics at the Department of Agricultural Sciences, University of Sassari, Italy.

Yves Jégourel, Head of the Banking, Finance and International trade Masters Program & Associate Professor in Finance, University of Bordeaux & Senior Fellow, OCP Policy Center

Michael Tamvakis, Professor of Commodity Economics and Finance & Director in MSc in Energy, Trade & Finance, Cass Business School, City University of London

List of Abbreviations

bbbl	: barrel of oil
CAP	: Common Agricultural Policy
CBOT	: Chicago Board of Trades
CCC	: Commodity Credit Corporation
CFTC	: Commodity Futures Trading Commission
CFR	: Cost and Freight
CIT	: Commodity Index Trader
CME	: Chicago Mercantile Exchange
COT	: Commitment of Traders
CTA	: Commodity Trading Advisors
CZCE	: Zhengzhou Commodity Exchange
DAP	: Di-Ammonium of Phosphate
DCE	: Dalian Commodity Exchange
DJ-USBSCI	: Dow Jones-Union of Bank of Switzerland Commodity Index
EIA	: U.S. Energy Information Administration
ETP	: External Trade of Products
HRC	: Hot Rolled Coils
ICA	: International Commodity Agreement
ICE	: Intercontinental Exchange
IEA	: International Energy Agency
IMM	: International Monetary Market
JKM	: Japan Korea Market
KBT	: Kansas Board of Trades
LLDPE	: Linear Low Density Polyethylene
LNG	: Liquefied Natural Gas
MAP	: Mono Ammonium Phosphate

mb/d : million barrels per day
MCX : Multi Commodity Exchange of India
mmbtu : million British thermal units
NASDAQ: National Association of Securities Dealers Automated Quotations
NPK : Nitrogen (N), Phosphorus (P), Potassium (K)
NYCE : New York Cotton Exchange
NYMEX: New York Mercantile Exchange
NYSE : New York Stock Exchange
OECD : Organization of Economic Cooperation and Development
OPEC : Organization of Petroleum Exporting Countries
OTC : Over the Counter
SGX : Singapore Exchange
SHFE : Shanghai Futures Exchanges
SOE : State Owned Enterprises
SPGSCI: Standard and Poor's Goldman Sachs Commodity Index
TSP : Triple Super Phosphate
USSR : Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
VAR : Vector Auto Regressive
WTI : West Texas Intermediate
WWII : World War II

Foreword

Financialization is a neologism now widely used in the media and political sphere, but also in the academic world. A concept that has acquired such importance and seems so well known that sometimes it does not need to be defined. The problem with this approach is not so much that this notion is ambiguous, but that the perimeter granted to it varies considerably. According to the Roosevelt Institute, this phenomenon is indeed characterized, in its most general sense, by “the growth of the financial sector, its increased power over the real economy, the explosion in the power of wealth, and the reduction of all of society to the realm of finance” . On the other hand, in a much narrower approach dedicated to the commodity world, the phenomenon of financialization has often been defined as the growing importance of investment funds, such as ETFs, whose vocation is to offer their subscribers a financial performance resulting from the increase in commodity prices. With such diversity, delineating with the utmost precision the contours of a phenomenon whose economic and, in some cases, societal consequences are considerable, is essential.

In that connection, and faithful to its vocation to both fully engage in issues of interest to the African continent and to produce a number of studies or recommendations in the field of public policy, OCP Policy Center has invited a number of international experts to propose their analysis on the definition and stakes of the financialization of commodity industries. Despite the end of the so-called commodity “super-cycle” which has witnessed the dismissal of “long” speculation on ever-rising commodity prices over the period 2002-2012, this remains indeed an unavoidable topic with keenly debated but unanswered questions. What is the medium by which financialisation takes place? What are the implications for producers and consumers of strengthening commodity derivatives markets? Who are the main beneficiaries and what is to be feared? In particular, to what extent does financialization fuel speculation and exacerbate physical market instability? What are the recent trends in commodity market financialization and what will be its reality in the years to come? So many questions that call for answers.

In a first chapter, Pr. Helyette Geman reminds us, through a review of recent literature, that financialization is multifaceted and that it has therefore

been analyzed in a significantly varied way. Pr Geman also clarifies what was the responsibility of index funds in the very sharp rise in commodity prices over the first decade of this century. She dedicates the last part of her chapter to the analysis of a market that has not yet seen any financialization and which is of growing importance for the world and Africa: that of fertilizers. John Baffes offers us a different analysis by favoring a historical approach to the different price-setting mechanisms that prevail in the commodity world. In particular, the author's ambition is to show how competitive pricing mechanisms have asserted or faded over the past two centuries. He reminds us that competitive pricing reemerged after the collapse of the Bretton Woods system with the introduction of financial derivatives, market-friendly policies, the shift to market-orientation of centrally planned economies, and the collapse of International Cartel Agreement. This question relating to the nature of price references on commodity markets is of particular importance because the notion of financialization cannot be reduced to the mere question of commodity index funds. The affirmation of a derivative market means, first and foremost, the emergence of a price that will not only serve as a reference for an entire industry but that will also be subject to both changes in the fundamentals of physical markets and to speculative dynamics. Pr. Luciano Gutierrez, in his chapter, focuses on the analysis of agricultural markets, which we know were at the heart of the debates surrounding the dangers of financialization. In addition to identifying the main benefits but also the risks associated with this profound change, Luciano Gutierrez proposes an econometric analysis based on the VAR methodology to measure the impact of financialization on corn, wheat and soybean price formation. In this context, he shows that this phenomenon has amplified food price movements with spot prices for maize and wheat being influenced by financial variables in the short-run. Yves Jégourel also examines financialization in the context of specific commodity markets: primary aluminum, iron ore and steel. These choices have not been made randomly for each of these minerals/metals strongly illustrates that the path towards greater financialization is not unique. In this context, he suggests that the specific nature of the conundrum that links the financialization process to the industrial organization that produces, processes, trades and consumes a given commodity should be investigated. With regards to the fifth and final chapter of this report, Pr. Michael Tamvakis focuses on Chinese commodity derivatives markets. After briefly recalling the history of these markets and describing the reality of futures contracts which are traded on the Dalian Commodity Exchange, on the Zhengzhou Commodity Exchange or on the

Shanghai Futures Exchange, Michael Tamkavis looks at their performance and discusses the next steps that could make China a country with reference derivatives markets.

This report would probably not have been possible without the close relationship that the OCP Policy Center has with the academic world and its researchers, whether senior fellow of the OCP Policy Center or not. It is one of many contributions from the OCP Policy Center and I can only invite our readers to consult on our website.

Karim El Aynaoui

Managing Director, OCP Policy Center,
Dean of the School of Economics
and Social Sciences, Mohammed VI
Polytechnic University